

Minutes of a Meeting of

City of Bay Village Civil Service Commission

Held June 1, 2016

1:00 p.m.

Members Present: James Potter, Chairman, Marty Krebs, Dennis Lekan

Also present: Police Chief Spaetzel, Fire Chief Lyons, Firefighter Sam Gmetro, and Firefighter Tom Garuccio

Chairman Potter called the seventh meeting of the Civil Service Commission in the year 2016 to order at 1:00 p.m.

Motion by Krebs, second by Lekan, to approve the minutes of May 25, 2016 as prepared and distributed.

Roll Call Vote: Yeas – Potter, Krebs, Lekan

Motion carried. 3-0

Civilian Police Dispatchers

Police Chief Spaetzel expressed appreciation to the Civil Service Commission for the opportunity to revisit the issue of Civilian Police Dispatchers. The desire of the Chief of Police is to remove the part time Police Dispatchers from Civil Service testing. A letter dated May 31, 2016, was sent to the Civil Service Commission outlining evaluation exercises received from the City of Amherst that would be conducted by the Police Department prior to the initial interview scheduled with a part-time dispatch candidate. A copy of the letter and evaluation exercises are attached to these minutes as Exhibit A. Dr. Lekan stated that he went through a sampling of each of the exercises, and they are very challenging and much along the lines of the testing that was done by Ramsey and Associates for the Civil Service Commission. Dr. Lekan stated that anyone who would do a good job on this test would do a good job as a dispatcher.

Chief Spaetzel stated that offers have been made to two full time Police Dispatchers, conditional upon finishing the background checks and medical examinations. Barring any obstacles, the employees will begin employment June 13, 2016.

Mr. Potter asked Chief Spaetzel if he has determined that there would be any copyright issues if using the Amherst test for screening part-time dispatchers for Bay Village. Chief Spaetzel stated he will investigate further, but he does like the format of the test and would follow either the Amherst test or something very similar.

Mr. Potter stated that one of the concerns he might have is that if the Civil Service Commission decides to use the Amherst evaluation we could conceivably have two different sets of part time

employees: those who are Civil Service and have passed the examination, and those who have not. Those who have passed the Civil Service examination have a legitimate opportunity to become a full time Police Dispatcher with Civil Service status.

Chief Spaetzel stated that there are six or seven candidates for the part time position that remain on the list for the interview process. Once the full-time employees are in place, they will be looking at those candidates for the part time position.

Dr. Lekan stated that the part time candidates who took the Ramsey and Associates test would be eligible to become full-time dispatchers with Civil Service classification. New part time employees who do not take the Civil Service examination would take the screening test proposed by Chief Spaetzel, but if they want to become full-time dispatchers they would have to take the Civil Service examination.

Mrs. Krebs referred to the City of Bay Village Civil Services Rules and Regulations, which state under Rule 1. Definition of Terms: "3. 'Unclassified service' refers to and includes the following officers and employees in the service of the City of Bay Village: '(i) such other officers and employees as the Commission by **resolution may lawfully exempt from the classified service of the City of Bay Village.**'"

Mrs. Krebs stated that it is her understanding from this rule that the Civil Service Commission would entertain a resolution that would exempt the Part Time Police Dispatchers as unclassified employees. The Law Director will be consulted for further clarification.

Mr. Potter suggested that Chief Spaetzel continue the background investigation and interviewing process for the remaining part time candidates on the Civil Service list. Law Director Ebert will be asked to craft a resolution that would exempt from Civil Service part-time Police Dispatchers, but grandfather in the part-time candidates who have taken the Civil Service examination, and if hired, would be Civil Service employees.

Fire Lieutenant Examination conducted on May 3, 2016

Mr. Potter stated that in regard to the challenges that were made by those firefighters who took the Fire Lieutenant Promotional Examination conducted May 3, 2016, there has been a follow-up response to the initial response of Clancy and Associates, who administered the examination. The follow-up response dated May 29, 2016 from Clancy and Associates is as follows:

"May 29, 2016

Joan Kemper, Clerk of Council
Secretary to Boards and Commissions
City of Bay Village, Ohio
350 Dover Center Road
Bay Village, Ohio 44140

Dear Ms. Kemper:

The purpose of the first protest period is to perfect the examination. Perfecting the examination may mean changing the answer to a question and/or removing the question from the examination if it is an invalid question. When a question is deleted, answer sheets are graded as if the question never appeared on the test. No candidates get it right or wrong.

The following are the responses and recommendations of Clancy and Associates to the protest challenges to the Fire Lieutenant promotional examination administered on May 3rd, 2016:

Question #3: In our opinion question #3 should be removed from consideration. Our opinion is based on the reasoning set forth in the protest. The question asks for "five" major areas and the correct answer has six major areas.

Question # 10: In our opinion the protest to this question should be denied. The best answer to this question is response C. This question is taken directly from Page 14 of the reference. The firefighter's ability to recognize a construction type is important because each construction type reacts to fire conditions in a different manner. Response A and B are actually part of and included in response C.

Merely because this question is the same as question #30 does not invalidate this question to justify deleting it from the examination.

Question # 13: In our opinion the protest to this question should be granted and the question should be deleted from the examination. As stated in the protest there can be two correct answers to this question. Response A is correct based on the Bay Village Fire Departments Policies. Response B is correct based on the Company Officer reference. The examination did not identify the reference on which this question was based. Because of two correct answers, the question is invalid and should be deleted.

Question #27: In our opinion the protest to the question should be granted and response B should be considered the correct answer. Our opinion is based on the reasoning set forth in the protest. Response C is an incorrect response because as a building ages, its general condition deteriorates. Therefore, response E cannot be the correct answer.

Question # 30: In our opinion the protest to this question should be denied. Merely because the question is identical to question # 10 does not invalidate this question to justify deleting it from the examination.

Question # 38: In our opinion the protest to this question should be denied. Examples of a live load on a building are snow and rain. See page 82 of the reference. Response A is the correct answer to this question.

Question # 39: In our opinion the protest to this question should be denied. This question is taken directly from page 340 of the reference. The question is asking for the

most obvious fire protection problem based on the height of a high rise building. The most obvious is that exterior means of attack and rescue are not possible beyond a certain point as stated in Response B, and not open stairwells and elevator shafts and the variations of pressure in stand-pipe systems as stated in responses A and C. Response B is the correct answer.

Question # 46: In our opinion the protest to this question should be denied. There is no place in the reference that it is stated in reference to a partial building collapse that the remaining structure will collapse over a period of time. It does state on page 400 that the remaining structure is likely to be weakened. Response B is the correct answer.

Question # 49: In our opinion the protest to this question should be denied. The question is asking for the most significant characteristics of steel. According to the statement on page 259 of the reference, the deterioration of the strength of steel at elevated temperatures is the most significant characterization. Response B is the correct answer to the question.

Question # 58: In our opinion the protest to this question should be denied. The question is asking for the components the fire service typically deployed that provide the capability to respond and intervene while the customer's problem is actually occurring. It is a combination of human, hardware and software. Therefore, response D is the correct answer to the question.

Question # 70: In our opinion the protest to this question should be denied. Response C is an incorrect statement because proper size-up begins when the alarm is received and not when arriving at the scene. Response A is the correct answer.

Question #87: In our opinion the protest to this question should be denied. This question is taken directly from page XII of the reference. Training is not one of the primary forces that shapes firefighting tactics. The reference sets forth a number of examples of new technologies that have been developed shaping firefighting tactics. Response A is the correct answer.

Question #91: In our opinion the protest to this question should be denied. Skills and abilities are not the same thing. Skills is an observable competence to perform a learned act, whereas, ability is the competence to actually perform an observable behavior or a behavior that results in an observable product. Only ability is based on experience and work ethic and are developed over time. Response C is the correct answer.

Question #10 and #30: Regarding questions 10 and 30, response C and not response D is the best answer to this question. The firefighter's ability to recognize the construction type of a building is important because each construction type reacts to fire conditions in a different manner. This could be because of the fire load of the building. It is not because of the possibility of the fire communicating to another building. Response B is one of the factors included in response C. Because of this, and response A not being correct, response D cannot be correct.

Summary of recommendations:

#3	Grant	#46	Deny
#10	Deny	#49	Deny
#13	Grant	#58	Deny
#27	Grant B correct answer	#70	Deny
#30	Deny	#87	Deny
#38	Deny	#91	Deny
#39	Deny		

Attached are the questions that were protested for your reference.

It has been a pleasure serving the City of Bay Village. Once the final rulings have been made, by the Civil Service Commission, I will forward the results of the examination.

Sincerely,

Vanessa Nietert
Vice-President"

Mr. Potter asked if the Fire Chief and firefighters present wish to comment on the response of Clancy and Associates. Firefighter Gmetro stated that there had been previous discussion about removing either Question 10 or Question 30, or both, since the questions were identical. Firefighter Gmetro stated that the two questions that were not addressed in the May 25, 2016 response were Questions 13 and 58. Question No. 58 was protested by some of the candidates because it was very unclear. There are words missing from the question that keeps it from being a valid question. Firefighter Gmetro stated that he brought the study material for reference by the Commission.

Mr. Potter **MOVED**, second by Lekan, that the Civil Service Commission grant and deny the challenges as set forth by Clancy and Associates in their letter of May 29, 2016. Mrs. Krebs asked if both Questions 10 and 30 will be retained, as they are the same question. Clancy and Associates suggests keeping both questions as valid questions.

Roll Call Vote: Yeas – Potter, Krebs, Lekan
Nays – None.

Motion carried 3-0.

Clancy and Associates will now grade the examination papers and forward the results to the Commission. When the results are received, the Commission will match the grades with the identification cards which are in sealed envelopes. Those receiving a grade of 70% or more will move on to the oral assessment portion of the examination to be held June 25, 2016 and June 26, 2016. In accordance with the Rules and Regulations of the Civil Service Commission, the candidates will have a five day period following the receipt of their grades to check the accuracy of the scoring.

Minutes of Civil Service Commission Meeting
Held June 1, 2016

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 1:30 p.m.

James R. Potter, Chairman

Joan Kemper, Secretary



Exhibit "A" 6/3/16

CITY of BAY VILLAGE

**DIVISION OF POLICE / 28000 Wolf Road
Bay Village, Ohio 44140 Phone (440) 871-1234**

Fax (440) 899-3478

MARK A. SPAETZEL

CHIEF OF POLICE

FBINA 215

Date: May 31, 2016
To: Civil Service Commission Members
From: Chief Mark Spaetzel
RE: Part time dispatcher screening tool

The practical dispatcher evaluation exercises would be conducted prior to the initial interview scheduled with the part-time dispatch candidate. Approximately 45 minutes would be set aside to complete the exercises. BVPD personnel would give the exercises which would be done in writing on a provided answer sheet and on a computer. It is not our intention to rank candidates by score but use the results in the same manner we use all our background processes - as another screening tool to evaluate and choose the best possible candidate for our position. I would anticipate we would also use the same exercises to evaluate future full time dispatcher candidates.

I have attached Amherst PD's short explanation of each exercise (or track on the CD). For Amherst PD, the exercises are available on a CD which plays audio that the candidates respond to either in writing or on the computer in a Word document. We do not intend on asking questions about Bay Village as Amherst does with their city, but we may do some type of grammatical exercise. These exercises have been used on over 100 individuals in Amherst since 2002 and many more in Lorain. The Amherst scores have been tracked to gather an average for each exercise and an aggregate average for the complete battery of exercises. Amherst PD adapted these from a 911 training course. I would anticipate we could create our own similar exercises as needed.

I would like your opinion on conducting a similar set of exercises as an additional tool to screen our candidates.

Track # 1: Split Ear Multiple Task combination of letters, colors and numbers. You need to get as much information in the appropriate columns as possible.

Track #3: Visualization series of simulated 911 calls. Listen to the calls and record the facts. When the call is done, it gives you time to write what your impression is, and to record what information you would pass on to responders.

Track # 4: Keyboarding Accuracy You will hear a series of names, businesses, addresses and phone numbers. Some will be spelled for you. Type all the information for 100% accuracy. At the end of each address and phone number hit enter to start a new line.

Track #6: Call Taking You will hear three (3) simulated calls to 911. Calls will have interaction with a call-taker. You are to listen to the call and fill in all the information. Goal is to record the information quickly and accurately and to write a narrative of what you believe the call is about and what information is important.

Track# 7: Listening ATL/BOLO listen to the information once the tone sounds record what information you can remember. Do not write while the recording is playing. It will give you time to write what you can remember before moving on to the next.

Track#9 Taking Descriptions You will hear a series of person and vehicle descriptions. Your job is to record all information while it is being given as quickly as possible. Once completed, you will read back the information for accuracy.

Amherst Questions: 5 questions about the city and 5 pertaining to direction.

Grammar: 20 grammar mistakes. Give them some time to complete.